

## Journal Article Critique

**The format:** The review should begin with a listing of the article(s) to be reviewed at the top of the first page. The listing should include for each article: Author, Title, Journal, Date of Journal, pages. For example, your first page might begin as follows:

**Article(s) Reviewed:**

Jones, Peter, "Wile E. Goes to Moscow," *Acme Journal of Pyrotecnics*, October, 1994, Vol. 1, No. 3, pp. 34-68.

Smith, Pam, "Wile E. Goes to China," *Acme Journal of Travel*, Sept., 1992, pp. 3-10.

(Note: Article titles are in parentheses. Journal titles are italicized or underlined.)

**Review Criteria:** The articles reviewed must be taken from recognized professional journals, not news magazines or newspapers unless specifically approved by the instructor. The reviews should seek to address the following questions:

- A. **Topic or Focus.** What is the topic or focus of the article(s)? Is there a clear statement of the research problem and issues being addressed?
- B. **Thesis or argument.** The thesis or argument should be summarized, analyzed and evaluated. Are the variables conceptually and operationally defined? What are the hypotheses?
- C. **Methodology.** Look at the basis of the thesis or argument in terms of methodology used by the author(s). What kind of research was done? What is your evaluation of the research design? Are there any problems with validity and reliability of the methodology used, the samples used, the data selected, etc? Look at tables, charts, graphics. Are they correct? Do you have any suggestions for improvements in the research design or methodology used by the authors?
- D. **Assumptions/Biases.** What kinds of biases or assumptions underlay the research and arguments of the article? Does the evidence suggest a conclusion based on an objective consideration of all sides of an issue and all the facts or an effort by the authors to defend an argument or thesis through selective use of facts?
- E. **Recommendations.** Summarize and evaluate any recommendations for policy made by the authors. If doing a comparative review, to compare and evaluate recommendations.
- F. **Persuasiveness.** Did you find the analyses, arguments and/or recommendations made persuasive? Why or why not?

**Suggestion:** Read some book reviews from a professional journal or the Sunday NYT Book Review section.